

目錄

「中國基督教史研究叢書」總序 邢福增	vii
Preface by Wickeri Philip L. Wickeri	ix
徐序 徐以驊	xiv
吳序——寫在文集出版前夕 吳宗素	xviii
編者序 邢福增	xxiv
一·新思潮與非基運動	1
1. 吳耀宗與非基督教運動 張化	3
2. 比較吳耀宗和趙紫宸對「宗教非（反）科學」的回應 ——以《沒有人看見過上帝》和《基督教哲學》為例 段琦	35
二·神學思想	93
1. 社會福音與個人福音 ——吳耀宗先生福音觀淺探 嚴錫禹	95
2. 試論吳耀宗有關上帝的定義 宋軍	115
3. 吳耀宗的上帝觀與祈禱觀 ——中國境界工夫哲學進路下的詮釋 陳廣培	130
4. 試論吳耀宗脈絡化基督論的取向與時代意義 許開明	154
5. Nascent Chinese Protestant Political Theology Pioneers from Wu Leichuan to Wu Yaozong Wan Sze-kar	212

三·學生運動與救亡運動	251
1. 吳耀宗與基督徒學生	
——從民國知識分子角度解讀 郭偉聯	253
2. Expanding Social Networks	
A Case Study of Cora Deng and Y. T. Wu on Their Roles and	
Participation in the National Salvation Movement in 1930s	
China Wong Wai-yin Christina	291
四·三自運動	341
1. 吳耀宗與中國基督教三自運動的再思 吳梓明	343
2. 吳耀宗與新中國成立初期的基督教訪問團 劉建平	372
3. 吳耀宗與三自愛國運動 羅偉虹	399
4. 理解吳耀宗 王艾明	419
5. 「愛國」與「愛教」	
——中共建國前後吳耀宗對政教關係的理解 邢福增	465
附錄	507
1. 落花有意，流水無情——我所知道的父親 吳宗素	509
2. 父親吳耀宗 2006 年 11 月 4 日遷葬上海福壽園 吳宗素	612
3. 吳耀宗先生、楊素蘭醫師遷葬儀式上吳宗素的	
發言 吳宗素	614
4. 「吳耀宗與中國基督教」學術研討會開幕詞 吳宗素	623
5. 「吳耀宗與中國基督教」學術研討會閉幕詞 吳宗素	626
作者簡介	631

中國基督教史研究叢書 總序

基督教中國宗教文化研究社社長 邢福增

如果我們把漢語基督教研究比喻為栽種各式花卉的園圃，那麼中國基督教史研究無疑是其中最盛放的花群，象徵有關研究領域業已取得豐富成果。

回想三十多年前，中國基督教史研究在兩岸三地學術界中，仍屬「邊緣」學科，投入研究的人員寥寥可數，往往是孤軍作戰，更遑論獨立研究學統的建立與發展。我們可從三方面來理解這種「邊緣性」：第一，華人史家（特別是從事近現代史研究者）普遍認定基督教與西方帝國主義及文化侵略的關係，這種民族情感阻礙了有關研究的展開，或只強調基督教與帝國主義的關係。第二，基督教史仍附屬於近代中國史之下，只能在相關的課題（如中外關係史、思想史、社會史、文化史）下始具認知意義。但這恰恰又強化了政治史、思想史、中外關係史、社會史在近代中國史的合法及正統地位，近代中國基督教史研究進一步被邊緣化。

第三，華人基督教界普遍認為歷史只具懷舊與感恩的工具價值，復加不重視史學方法的規範，強化了史學界視教會歷史學為歌功頌德工具的態度。

今天，整個形勢卻起了根本的改變，不論從研究的機構、隊伍，以至研究課題及視野方面，均呈百花齊放的局面。特別在中國大陸，涉及中國基督教史的研究成果如雨後春筍，更甬說以此為方向的碩士及博士論文。毋庸置疑，中國基督教史研究業已擺脫各種意識形態的桎梏，昔日令人生畏的「險學」，已演變為備受關注的「顯學」。儘管有關研究領域仍跟中國史研究息息相關，但在科際整合的要求下，結合社會學、人類學、歷史學、宗教學及神學的視角與方法，也在形塑有關學統，並漸具備獨立學科的雛型。如何在堅實史料的基礎上，借鑑其他學科的優點，進一步開拓對中國基督教史的研究，誠然是今後不可迴避的挑戰。

基督教中國宗教文化研究社自 1957 年創立以來，在歷任社長、同工努力下，一直致力於探索基督教與中國文化、宗教的不同課題，並確立了中國基督教及基督教與中國宗教文化的兩大關注方向。超過半個世紀的實踐，我們藉出版「景風叢書」及「香港教會系列」，業已對學術界及教會界作出貢獻。現在我們決定新闢「中國基督教史研究叢書」，旨在出版具素質的研究成果，為有志投身中國基督教史研究的學者提供園地，並匯聚不同學者，搭建研究平台，促進有關學統的成熟發展。

回想昔日在中國基督教史研究園地辛勞撒種耕耘者，我們不敢自滿。謹呈獻本系列，期望中國基督教史園地，能結出更多成果。

Preface by Wickeri

Philip L. Wickeri

Mr. Wu Yaozong (1893–1979)¹ was one of the most important Chinese Christian leaders of the mid-twentieth century. That he was controversial goes without saying. From a historical point of view, this makes him all the more interesting as a subject of study. Whether he is seen as a prophet or a betrayer of the faith, a hopeful presence or a tragic figure, Y. T. Wu was a significant voice in Chinese Christianity for more than three decades.

¹ 吳耀宗, known in English as Wu Yao-tsung or more commonly Y. T. Wu. There are no recent studies of Y. T. Wu in Western languages, nor is there a full biography of Wu in any language. The best study of Y. T. Wu in English is still Ng Lee-ming, "A Study of Y. T. Wu," *Ching Feng* 15, no. 1 (1972): 5–54. Also see Howard L. Boorman, ed., "Wu Yao-tsung," *Biographical Dictionary of Republican China*, vol. 3 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1970), 457–460; Gao Wangzhi, "Y. T. Wu: A Chinese Christian Leader Under Communism," in Daniel H. Bays, ed., *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 338–352; and in German, Chen Chi-rong, *Wu Yao-tsung: Ein Theologie im sozialistischen China, 1920–1960* (Munster: Lit Verlag, 1992).

Y. T. Wu was the leading spirit behind the Chinese Christian Three-self Patriotic Movement (TSPM) from its formative period in 1950 until his death after the end of China's Cultural Revolution era. From the 1930s onward, he allied himself with the United Front that ultimately brought the Chinese Communist Party, and was the leading Christian voice urging Chinese Christians to involve themselves in movements for social change.

Born in Guangzhou (Canton) to a non-Christian family, Wu became a Christian through his response to the "Sermon on the Mount" and was baptized in Beijing in 1918. The account of his religious conversion is quite moving, and he impressed both Chinese Christians and foreign missionaries. He subsequently left his lucrative job in the customs service, and joined the work of the YMCA. Y. T. Wu studied at New York's Union Theological Seminary and Columbia University, where he received an M.A. in 1927. Upon his return to China, he was active in the YMCA movement at home and internationally. He gradually abandoned the pacifism of the Fellowship of Reconciliation and became increasingly committed to more radical, progressive and patriotic causes.

In 1947, he wrote "The Present Day Tragedy of Christianity in China," an essay which cost him his job at *Tianfeng* 天風, then still controlled by American missionary interests. Toward the end of that essay he observed,

The historic tragedy of Christianity is that, in its history of the past hundred years, Christianity has unconsciously changed to become a conservative force. And now at the present stage, it has become a reactionary force. Christianity feels warm and comfortable in the present system, because its doctrines and its spirit have been brought to birth by this system. So it clings to the special position and false liberty that it has received from this system. Still, this is not enough to call it a tragedy. The tragedy lies in the fact that the Capitalist nations not only regard as gospel their own plans for resisting the course of history, but use their financial and military power to bolster

the reactionary forces in other countries.²

The language is dated, but the thinking is incisive and the critique prophetic. Even in these times of American decline, economic crises, and the apparent triumph of neo-liberalism, Protestant Christianity continues to be identified with Right Wing politics in many parts of the world. In his analysis of Christianity in the late 1940s, and its identification with capitalism and imperialism, Y. T. Wu foreshadowed the best of the Liberation theologies that began to emerge in Latin America and elsewhere twenty years later.

Y. T. Wu was the principal author of the 1950 "Christian Manifesto" which called on the Protestant churches to sever their links with imperialism. In 1954, he became the Chairman of the TSPM Committee at the First Chinese National Christian Conference, a position he held until his death. In the mid-1950s he turned the attention of the TSPM toward building up the church. During these years, he also held positions in the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference and local Shanghai consultative bodies. He had become the most influential public voice of Christianity in the first decades of the People's Republic of China.

By the late nineteen fifties or early sixties, however, Y. T. Wu no longer seemed to be setting the direction in which the TSPM was moving. His voice and perhaps his position were not as commanding as they once were. He was criticized by "Leftist" activists in Shanghai during the Cultural Revolution, and little was heard from him in the last decade of his life. Like so many others of his generation, he was changed and left behind in the course of the history of the cataclysmic Cultural Revolution, now known as the "ten years of upheaval."

² Y. T. Wu 吳耀宗, "Jidujiao de shidai beiju" 基督教的時代悲劇 [The Present Day Tragedy of Christianity in China], *Tianfeng* 天風 116 (April 10, 1948): 1-4. Translation adapted from Wallace Merwin and Francis Price Jones, comp., *Documents of the Three-self Movement* (New York: National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA, 1963), 5.

Nevertheless, Y. T. Wu has left an important legacy for Protestant Christianity in China. Through the power of his personality, his commitment to Christian social involvement, and his speaking and writing, Y. T. Wu inspired the men and women who were to become the core leadership of the TSPM for the next fifty years. He was criticized in many quarters for advocating Christian participation in the social movements of the 1950s, and he earned the undying opprobrium of conservative evangelical Christians because of his political and theological beliefs. In the TSPM today, he is revered and beyond serious criticism.³ It will take a new generation of Chinese Christian scholars to come to terms with what Y. T. Wu has meant historically for church and society.

The June 2010 conference “Wu Yaozong and Chinese Christianity” sponsored by the Centre for the Study of Religion and Chinese Society of Chung Chi College, the Chinese University of Hong Kong, was an important occasion to discuss and reflect upon the life and work of Y. T. Wu. We are indebted to Prof. Ying Fuk-tsang and others who organized this important gathering. Fifteen scholars from Hong Kong, Taiwan, mainland China and North America attended the meeting. Discussions during the three-day conference were lively and at times intense. The papers that appear here have been revised on the basis of those exchanges. Even a casual reading of this volume will reveal that the life and thought of Y. T. Wu continues to be subject to very different interpretations, historically, theologically and politically.

³ The TSPM and China Christian Council (CCC) have recently published a collection of Wu's writings: *Wu Yaozong wenxuan* 吳耀宗文選 [Selected Writings of Wu Yaozong] (Shanghai: Zhongguo Jidujiao lianghui chubanshu, 2010). It would be interesting to compare the essays in this book with the original versions as they first appeared in print. In addition, several memorial volumes for Y. T. Wu have been published by the TSPM and the CCC in the last thirty years as a biography by Shen Derong 沈德溶: *Wu Yaozong xiaozhuan* 吳耀宗小傳 [A Short Biography of Wu Yaozong] (Shanghai: Zhongguo Jidujiao sanzhi aiguo yundong weiyuanhui, 1989).

Among the contributions to this volume, I would like to call particular attention to the lengthy essay by his son Mr. Wu Tsung-su (Wu Zongsu) whom I met at the conference, and who did much to make our gathering possible. The title of this essay 〈落花有意，流水無情——我所知道的父親〉 is difficult to render into English, "The Flower Sheds its Petals in Devotion, but the Brook Babbles Heartlessly on: My Father as I Knew Him." It is a poetic title for an essay that tells the story of a devoted and faithful Christian leader, a historical figure whose life his son sees as tragic. This essay is also a detailed portrait of a father by his son, very much more than a filial tribute. I personally hope that it will find its way into English soon. There is no full study of Y. T. Wu in any language.⁴ We are, therefore, all the more indebted to T. S. Wu for providing this important interpretative account of Y. T. Wu's life based on his letters, journal entries and other sources. Scholars will have different views of his analysis, but this essay provides a wealth of material that is not available elsewhere.

The legacy of Y. T. Wu will continue to be discussed and debated. All of the essays in this volume will help us come to a more reasoned judgment of his significance. What should not be forgotten is Y. T. Wu the person, a thoughtful Christian and a man of prayer, a Chinese Christian who lived through difficult times, one who made his share of mistakes, but also one who attempted things that not many of his generation, inside or outside the Church, thought possible.

Hong Kong

September 2011

⁴ According to T. S. Wu (Wu Zongsu), his father kept a diary all of his life. Extracts from some of these are included in his essay. However, Y. T. Wu's full diaries were confiscated by the Chinese government shortly after his death, and all attempts by the family to recover them have been to no avail. Archival materials on Y. T. Wu's life after 1950 are for the most part unavailable to the researcher. This would make any full biographical study of the last thirty years of his life extremely difficult at the present time.

徐 序

徐以驊

寫序言難，寫關於時代標誌性人物研究專輯的序言當然更難。吳耀宗先生的「極富爭議」大概是關於吳先生研究最無爭議的一點。褒之者稱其為「中國教會的先知」、「愛國愛教的典範」和「解放神學的先驅」；貶之者對其的批評和攻擊不遺餘力；當然對之不解、誤解和曲解者也大有人在。吳耀宗先生曾寫過論述中國乃至世界基督教的名篇〈基督教的時代悲劇〉，但他本人卻被稱為「悲劇性的歷史人物」。不過覆巢之下安有完卵，在時代大潮的裹挾下中國基督教會中又有幾人能真正左右自己的命運呢？

大概正是因為富於爭議難以解讀的原因，吳耀宗先生這位舉世矚目的中國基督教三自愛國運動發起人可能是中國基督教領袖人物中得到較少學術關注的一位。如果把關於吳先生的研究粗略地分為兩個階段，那麼第一階段可稱為以回憶及紀念專輯和文

©基督教中國宗教文化研究社有限公司，二零一一年